Evidence Base Camp: Day 3
Sifting Sessions

Nicky Miller – Research Unit
Jo Wilkinson – Research Unit
Lynn O’Mahony – National Police Library
Research question

What interventions have been shown to be effective in getting out of prostitution?
Today...

1. Present outcomes of initial searches
   • What happened while you were away...

2. Collaboratively develop sift criteria

3. Collaborative sifting
   • Get a view of what our search has returned
   • Refine sift criteria if required

4. Individual sifting
From there.....

1. (Prostitut* or (sex and (soliciting or solicitation or solicit*)) or “sex work*” or “street walk*” or “rent boy*” or “sex traffick*” or “sex touris*”)

2. AND ("getting out" or stop* or decreas* or reduc*)

3. AND (Tactic* OR intervention* OR strateg* OR initiative* OR procedure* OR approach*)

4. AND (“systematic review” OR “rapid evidence assessment” OR “literature review” OR trial OR “randomi?ed control trial” OR RCT OR experiment* OR evaluat* OR “best practice*” OR “good practice*” OR effectiv* OR assess* OR “what works” OR impact OR success*)

Resulted in 386 hits in Proquest

But...
The results we were getting were very poor – there appears to be very little material on actually getting people out of prostitution.

After much consideration and consultation with Research staff, it was decided to amend the question.

The question has been changed to "What interventions have been shown to be effective in responding to prostitution?" - we removed the 'getting out of' as there was very little research evidence coming back so we had to broaden the search, whilst still being able to keep the various synonyms and tiers developed from EBC 1.

The search was run on other platforms (EBSCO and Web of Knowledge) to ensure we had enough results to search today.
Final search terms

1. (((Prostitut* or ((hooker or Hustl*) and sex*) or "Sex service*" or "Rent boy*" or "Sex work*" or "Kerb crawl*" or "Call girl*" or "Red light district" or Brothel or "Sex tourism" or Pimp* or "Street worker*" or "street walker*" or streetwalker* or Stripper* or "Sex slave*"))

2. AND (respond* or response* or stop* or decreas* or reduc* or prevent* or tackl* or control*)

3. AND ("systematic review" OR "rapid evidence assessment" OR "literature review" OR trial* OR "randomi?ed control trial" OR RCT OR experiment* OR evaluat* OR "best practice*" OR "good practice*" OR effectiv* OR assess* OR "what works" OR impact OR success*))

4. NOT (HIV OR DRUG*)
Final search terms resulted in:

- ProQuest – 900 hits, 711 exported
- EBSCO – 446 hits, 405 exported
- Total = 1116
- Ref man duplicate search (system and manual search) = 976
Group work
Building our inclusion criteria
Sift criteria - recap

- Sift criteria are a series of questions that help you decide if the abstract you are reading is useful to the research question and should be ‘called’ (the full paper requested).
- Questions in your sift criteria will often map across to the key elements or tiers of your search.
- The same set of questions are applied to all abstracts to attempt to remove bias/ overt ‘judgement calls’.
- Typically, a lot of papers identified by the search are excluded at this stage of the process.
What interventions have been shown to be effective in responding to prostitution?
Factors in our question

1. Prostitution
2. Responses / Interventions
3. Effectiveness / What works

So our sift criteria needs to address each of these points...

...and we may need to be careful about how we phrase our questions...

...and remember – we can refine our criteria as long as changes are consistently applied across the sift
# Inclusion Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Answer</th>
<th>Action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q1.</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Exclude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Go to Q2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unclear</td>
<td>Exclude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q2.</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Exclude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Go to Q3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unclear</td>
<td>Exclude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q3.</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Exclude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Include</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unclear</td>
<td>Can’t exclude</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Flag:**

**Other exclusions:**
## Example Inclusion Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Answer</th>
<th>Action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q1. Does the abstract focus on prostitution?</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Exclude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Go to Q2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unclear</td>
<td>Exclude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q2. Does the abstract identify responses/ways to tackle prostitution?</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Exclude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Go to Q3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unclear</td>
<td>Exclude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q3. Does the paper include: Empirical data/ methods</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Exclude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Include</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unclear</td>
<td>Can’t exclude</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Flag:** Attitudes pieces; Trafficking; child sexual exploitation

**Other exclusions:**
1st Prostitution abstract


**Keywords:** Anthropology/Behaviourism/Cambodia/Consumerism/Ethnic minorities/Globalization/Human trafficking/Migration

**Abstract:** This research paper presents the findings of a research undertaken in Ratanakiri province, Kingdom of Cambodia (Under the RETA 6190 ADB TA project on 'Preventing the Trafficking of Women and Children and Promoting Safe Migration in the GMS'), with the aim to evaluate the impact of an airport rehabilitation project. It highlights the role that infrastructure development, with a focus on tourism-related projects, can play in a remote rural area and its consequences on local population, especially ethnic minorities. For remote areas, tourism is considered as an accelerating influence on globalisation and in-migration, which, in turn, are seen as the main factors affecting remote local communities to modify behaviours changing from valuing utility to valuing exchange. The rapidity of these cultural changes increase rural depopulation and the vulnerability of human beings to a range of negative situational factors, including loss of land, erosion of community structures and coping mechanisms, and as well as exploitative practices such as debt bondage, prostitution and human trafficking. Reproduced by permission of Taylor and Francis Ltd
2nd Prostitution abstract


**Keywords:** Bias, Bootstrap method, Estimating techniques, Sampling techniques, Sex industry, Shanghai China, Social classes, Sociology, Women

**Abstract:** Respondent-driven sampling (RDS) is a method for recruiting "hidden" populations through a network-based, chain and peer referral process. RDS recruits hidden populations more effectively than other sampling methods and promises to generate unbiased estimates of their characteristics. RDS's faithful representation of hidden populations relies on the validity of core assumptions regarding the unobserved referral process. With empirical recruitment data from an RDS study of female sex workers (FSWs) in Shanghai, we assess the RDS assumption that participants recruit nonpreferentially from among their network alters. We also present a bootstrap method for constructing the confidence intervals around RDS estimates. This approach uniquely incorporates real-world features of the population under study (e.g., the sample's observed branching structure). We then extend this approach to approximate the distribution of RDS estimates under various peer recruitment scenarios consistent with the data as a means to quantify the impact of recruitment bias and of rejection bias on the RDS estimates. We find that the hierarchical social organization of FSWs leads to recruitment biases by constraining RDS recruitment across social classes and introducing bias in the RDS estimates. [PUBLICATION ABSTRACT]
Poverty has degraded lives for centuries; and human deprivation is still persistent in the developing countries of the world. It is in this regard that this study examined the impact of poverty on senior secondary school girls' prospect for tertiary education in Nigeria. The aim was to ascertain the extent to which the prospect of senior secondary school girls for tertiary education is susceptible to poverty. The study was conducted adopting empirical design. The data used for the study were time series data. A stochastic model was specified for the study to show the impact of poverty on senior secondary school girls' prospect for tertiary education in Nigeria during the period under study (1992 - 2011). The ordinary least square (OLS) regression technique with econometric views 3 software was used to analyze the study's data. The estimated result showed that both poverty and unemployment are significant determinants of senior secondary school girls' prospect for tertiary education in Nigeria. It is therefore suggested among other things that Governments should not only direct policy actions towards encouraging the education of the girls from poor homes by creating separate scholarship platforms for them that can fund their education from secondary school to university level; but also should extend the free education policy to secondary school level in order to give every child from a poor home the opportunity to have at least secondary education. This would help to reduce the girlchild trafficking for sex work, as well as all poverty stimulated juvenile delinquencies in the country. [PUBLICATION ABSTRACT]
4th Prostitution abstract


Keywords: Adolescent/Adolescents/Alternative schools (05261)/Female/Females/High school education (04563)/Homeless children (10284)/Juvenile prostitution (05397)/Juvenile self concept (09384)/Male/Males/Prostitution/Research/School dropouts (09264)/Self Esteem/Studies/Washington (53000)

Abstract: Prostitution-involved adolescents assigned themselves to one of three groups (school attenders of alternative street school, unable to attend, or school refusers) in this study designed to evaluate the alternative school experience. Subjects included 114 prostitution-involved youth, 58 females and 56 males, who ranged in age from 13 to 19 years and who came to a multiservice agency for street youth in Seattle, Washington, during 1987 and 1988. The alternative school experience involved a nontraditional, drop-in, open enrollment classroom for street youth that provided basic academic skills learning, computer literacy development, a life skills curriculum, and General Equivalency Diploma preparation. Four dependent variables were examined: frequency or incidence of prostitution behavior, depressive symptomatology, self-esteem, and school attitude. Data were collected at intake and 50 days after intake for the following measures: Reynolds Adolescent Depression Scale, Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale, Quality of School Life Scale, and self-reported weekly prostitution events. It was found that school attenders improved significantly on all measures, showing less depression, improved school sentiment, improved self-esteem, and reduced prostitution activity after less than 2 months of street school. Except for self-esteem, no significant changes on these dependent variables were observed for the other school groups (unable to attend and school refusers). Additional research is recommended to explore the long-term impact of alternative street school programs. 22 references, 1 table, and 4 figures

**Keywords:** Bosnia-Hercegovina/CRIMINOLOGY AND LAW ENFORCEMENT/Girls/Human trafficking/Police/Prostitution/Studies/Women

**Abstract:** The purpose of this research study is to examine law enforcement officers' attitudes pertaining to the sanctioning of individuals involved in the sex trade, with a particular focus on sex trafficking victims, sex traffickers, and men who purchase sex (herein referred to as customers). The current study relies on self-reported survey data from the Bosnian Border Police (BP) officers (+À = 363) collected in the summer of 2011 to assess officers' attitudes regarding the sex trade. Participants were asked to respond to a variety of statements reflecting attitudinal factors related to prostitution myths and criminal justice responses to sex trafficking victims, sex traffickers, and customers. Results from a series of multivariate statistical analyses indicate several factors to be associated with an officer's support for the arrest, incarceration, and deportation of trafficking victims, traffickers, and customers. These include adherence to prostitution myths, whether or not the officer had received training pertaining to human trafficking, and the officer's sex. Avenues for future research include an examination of the impact attitudes have on police behavior, an analysis of the content, duration and frequency of training programs offered to law enforcement, and consideration of the impact personal experiences with the sex trade have on attitude formation among the police. Findings presented have important implications for anti-trafficking programs, in particular those designed to educate and train criminal justice officials. Training programs need to include the provision of factual information regarding prostitution and sex trafficking.
Issues
Issues

1. Are we focusing on prevention and/or responses to those already engaged in prostitution? Yes – flag prevention
2. Responses to prostitution is our focus – should protective factors (education; poverty relief) be included? Exclude protective factors
3. Should social characteristics be included acting as determinants of prospects to enter into prostitution be included (race, class, gender, poverty, unemployment)? Exclude social characteristics
4. Historical accounts on the regulation of prostitution? Include post 1945 if focus on prostitution
5. Do (professional) attitudes impact on the quality and success of interventions? Include if linked to response/intervention
6. Should our focus include responses/interventions around prostitution-related trafficking for sexual exploitation? Yes
   – Voluntary or involuntary? Yes
   – Are treatment programmes a form of response? Yes
7. Is grooming for the purpose of children (age 13 or under) abused through prostitution? Yes if directly linked to prostitution
8. Focus on perpetrators/victims (customers/sex-workers)? Yes to all
9. Culture – location, etc – Many studies from specific locations – e.g. China, Cambodia, India decide on relevance from full papers. Yes – flag country if outside Europe/USA
10. Exclude medical interventions as a form of ‘controlling’ prostitution
# Inclusion Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Answer</th>
<th>Action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q1. Is the focus of the study on prostitution?</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Exclude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Go to Q2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unclear</td>
<td>Exclude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q2. Does the abstract identify responses/interventions?</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Exclude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Go to Q3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unclear</td>
<td>Exclude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q3. Does the paper include empirical data/methods?</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Exclude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Include</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unclear</td>
<td>Can’t exclude</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Flag:**

**Other exclusions:**
# Inclusion Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Answer</th>
<th>Action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q1. Is the primary focus of the abstract domestic abuse or domestic violence (remember the other synonyms)</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Exclude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Go to Q2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unclear</td>
<td>Exclude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q2. Is the abstract about identifying and/or measuring risk/ risk factors associated with domestic violence/ abuse</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Exclude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Go to Q3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unclear</td>
<td>Exclude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q3. Does the paper include: Empirical data/ methods</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Exclude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Include</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unclear</td>
<td>Can’t exclude</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Flag:** specific risk assessment models; perpetrators

**Other exclusions:** to be considered, e.g. location/ culture

Consider as a group if any adjustments/ classifications are needed after going through the five abstractions
Individual sifting (handouts)
Individual sifting (the real thing!)

• We are sifting hard copies of the abstracts
• Highlighters are provided – highlight the reference number:
  – Green for ‘include’
  – Orange for ‘unsure’
  – Leave ‘excluded’ abstracts blank
• Fill in your **sift template** to keep track of what you have sifted
• Please return all of the abstracts, sift templates and highlighters at the end of the day!

**Keywords:** "Aggression/*Assault/*Conflict/*Couples/*Emotional Abuse/*Hong Kong/*Management/*Risk/*Risk Factors/2858: studies in violence/studies in violence/article/lesbian/gay/bisexual intimate partner violence risk/protective factors Hong Kong/Risk factors

**Abstract:** Numerous studies have assessed risk and protective factors for intimate partner violence (IPV) among heterosexual couples around the globe. Nevertheless, few have addressed the same issue among same-sex couples, especially in cultures where same-sex intimate relationships have gained little acceptance. This exploratory study evaluated the substantial risk and protective factors for same-sex IPV based on gender-neutral theories. Three hundred and six Hong Kong residents who have been in a same-sex romantic relationship completed a web-based questionnaire. Logistic regression analyses indicated that relationship conflict and poor anger management were risk factors both of psychological and physical perpetration. Dominance and substance abuse were respectively associated with psychological aggression and physical battering despite their small effect sizes. Psychological aggression was also found to mediate the relationship between conflict and physical assault, and that between anger management and physical assault. Interventions related to the array of risk and protective factors were discussed and recommended. [Reprinted by permission of Sage Publications Inc., copyright holder.]

Each abstract is numbered

Pages are numbered

Some abstracts overlap from one page to another – if you don’t have the whole of an abstract in your pile, make a note of this on your sift template...

Any questions, just ask!